

Property Location: **428 Chautauqua Avenue**
Chautauqua Historic District

COA Request: **(HD 17-05)** Continuation of consideration of a Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a garage with associated concrete access pad in the rear yard and for a paved driveway in the front yard for property located at 428 Chautauqua Avenue (Continued from May 1, 2017 meeting).

Applicant/Owner: Mark Krittenbrink
301 Boyd St Suite 200 Norman, OK 73071

A. Background:

1. Historical Information:

2004 Chautauqua Historic District National Registry Nomination Survey states:

This circa 1907 Bungalow is a contributing structure to the Chautauqua Historic District. The one-story structure has a cross-gabled roof plan, a brick chimney and a brick foundation. The wood windows are one-over-one, hung. The full-width front porch has a cross-gabled roof supported by massive brick columns. Decorative details include triangular knee braces and double and triple windows. The house includes the wood deck on the southwest corner of the house.

Additional Information:

The Historic District Commission approved a COA that allowed the this structure to be relocated from from Lots 7 and 8 Block 1 of Ross\$ Addition to Lot 7 Block 1 of Ross\$ Addition at the December 1, 2014 meeting. The structure was moved in 2015.

2. COA Activity

January 6, 2014 . A COA was granted to relocate the structure to the south to Lot 8. (Jack Hooper, owner). This work was not completed.

December 1, 2014 . An amended COA was granted to allow the structure to be relocated north to Lot 7, for the removal of a non-original addition, and for the installation of a 10qwide driveway. This work was completed except for the driveway. (Mark Krittenbrink, owner).

March 2, 2015 - A COA was granted for a 2nd floor modification, comprised of 365 square feet to the existing house and for a two-story 974-square foot addition to the rear of the house. Together these two additions would have added 1,339 square feet to the existing house. This work was never started and the COA expired.

May 4, 2015 - COA was granted for the construction of a two-story garage with a footprint of 624 square feet, a concrete pad to provide access to the garage, and a side yard fence. The proposed work was never started and the COA expired.

May 1, 2017 – A COA was granted for the installation of an addition and a deck on the rear of the house. The request for a front driveway and garage in the rear were continued to allow the applicant to submit revised drawings.

3. Project Description:

As indicated under the Historical Information section of this report, this house was relocated from Lots 7 & 8 of Ross's Addition to Lot 7 in 2015 in order to provide two developable lots. Prior to the relocation of the house, the applicant received a COA to remove the non-original addition and the deck which he subsequently did prior to relocation. This same COA also allowed for the construction of a concrete driveway, identical to the one proposed in this application; however, he never installed the driveway and the COA expired. The applicant also received a COA for a two-story garage with a footprint of 624 square feet, and a two-story 1,339 square foot addition but did not start this proposed work and the COA expired.

At last month's meeting the applicant submitted a request for a garage and driveway that was very similar to the one that had been proposed and approved previously in May 2015. The applicant also requested an addition and a deck at last month's meeting. While the Commission approved the addition and deck, it found that the garage was not appropriate in mass and scale to the primary structure. The Commission requested the applicant consider redesigning the garage to a one-story structure and continued the request to allow the applicant time to revise the proposed garage if so desired. The Commission also continued the request for the driveway due to a lack of clarity as to whether a 10' wide or 15' driveway was being requested.

The applicant is now returning to the Commission with revised drawings that propose a one-story garage in the same design style and materials as the main structure. In addition, his drawing clarifies his desire for the installation of a 10' wide concrete driveway to replace the existing gravel driveway.

B. Analysis of Request:

Historic District Ordinance

***Section 429.3.3 (c)** Changes to rear elevations do require a COA; however the rear elevation of a historic structure is considered a secondary elevation and is therefore regulated to a lower standard to allow flexibility for additions or other modern day appurtenances.*

Historic Preservation Handbook

2.3 Guidelines for Garages & Accessory Structures

***.5 Make New Construction Compatible.** If a new garage is the approved alternative, it shall be compatible in form, scale, size, materials, features, and finish with the principal structure. New accessory structures shall maintain the traditional height and proportion of accessory buildings in the district.*

2.4 Guidelines for Sidewalks, Driveways, and Off-Street Parking

***.1 Driveway Location.** In historic districts, residential driveways shall be perpendicular to the street, except in individual cases where there is historical documentation of an alternate configuration. Unless there is historic documentation otherwise, driveways shall be located near the property line on one side of the house.*

***.2 Driveway Width.** Driveways shall be one car width, not to exceed 10 feet wide, unless there is historic documentation of an alternate configuration. Driveway width may vary as it approaches a garage in order to correspond to the width of the door opening.*

***.3 New Driveway Composition.** Driveways shall be constructed from material allowed by the Norman Zoning Ordinance. Existing gravel driveways may remain in place subject to other provisions in the City Code.*

***.5 Driveway Approaches.** Maintain the rhythm of existing approaches when introducing new driveways. Driveway approaches may be a maximum of 16 feet wide at the curb, narrowing to 10 feet at the sidewalk or property line.*

Staff Observations:

1. The primary structure is listed as a contributing structure to the Chautauqua Historic District according to the 1988 and 2001 surveys.

2. The property is an interior lot facing Chautauqua Street with an alley running along the rear of the property.
3. The front and side elevations of the primary structure are considered character defining elevations.
4. The primary structure was relocated to this lot in 2015. There are no other structures located on the lot. There is an existing front driveway composed of gravel.
5. The existing house is a one-story house of approximately 1,311 square feet.
6. The proposed garage is of a similar style to the principal structure and will have matching materials including wood siding and windows. The overhead garage doors will be metal.
7. The proposed garage is one-story with a footprint of 528 square feet and will have a concrete pad that provides access to the garage from the alley.
8. According to the applicant's drawings the proposed ridge height of the garage is 11'6" while the house's ridge height is 11'9". The proposed wall height of the garage is 10'2". This meets the Zoning Ordinance regulation regarding the height of the garage can not be taller than the height of the primary structure.
9. Historic garages in the Chautauqua Historic District are typically one-story and 400-500 square feet. The Historic District Commission has determined through review and approval of other garage requests that the Guidelines call for all garages to be limited to approximately 500 square feet.
10. The proposed garage will be located in the rear off the alley which is the preferred location for garages by the Guidelines and the City Zoning Ordinance. Portions of the garage may be visible from the front right-of-way.
11. The existing gravel driveway is approximately 15' in width and 36' in length.
12. Both the City Zoning Ordinance and the Historic District Guidelines allow property owners to maintain an existing front yard driveway in its current configuration and prohibit the addition or the expansion of front yard driveways when there is alley access to the rear yard for additional parking.
13. Concrete is an allowable material for a parking surface per City regulations.
14. Three trees will need to be removed to construct the garage. No trees will need to be removed for the proposed driveway.

Staff Analysis:

The following informed staff's recommendations regarding the request for proposed garage and driveway:

1. The primary structure is a historic structure located in the Chautauqua Historic District.
2. The proposed garage height meets the Zoning Ordinance code for height.
3. The proposed garage meets the Guidelines for form, materials features and finish with the principal structure. The garage does meet the traditional height for the Chautauqua District.
4. The proposed one-story garage meets the Guideline for size, scale, proportions and the garage is subservient to the principal structure.
5. The driveway meets the Guidelines for location, materials and allowable dimensions.
6. The removal of the three trees for the construction of the garage seems reasonable given the restrictions per Zoning Ordinance and Historic Guidelines for the placement of additional parking.

Staff Recommendations:

1. Since the garage and driveway meet the Historic District Guidelines as stated above, staff recommends approval.

Action Required: Motion to approve or reject the Certificate of Appropriateness for the installation of a garage with associated concrete access pad in the rear yard and for a paved driveway in the front yard for property located at 428 Chautauqua Avenue (Continued from May 1, 2017 meeting).